

**IDAHO REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD**  
**Bureau of Occupational Licenses**  
700 West State Street, P.O. Box 83720  
Boise, ID 83720-0063

**Board Meeting Minutes of 4/17/2019**

**BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:** Paul J Morgan - Chair  
H Scott Calhoun  
B Jane McClaran  
Eric J Brinton

**BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT:** Brent Lee Stanger

**BUREAU STAFF:** Kelley Packer, Bureau Chief  
Dawn Hall, Deputy Bureau Chief  
Julie Eavenson, Administrative Support Manager  
Lori Peel, Investigative Unit Manager  
Nicholas Krema, General Counsel  
Rob McQuade, Legal Counsel  
Eric Nelson, Board Prosecutor  
Cesley Metcalfe, Technical Records Specialist II

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Vicki Metcalf, Appraisal Subcommittee  
Claire Brooks, Appraisal Subcommittee  
Jason Gerhard, Licensed Residential Appraiser  
James More, Certified General Appraiser  
Jordan Roberts, Registered Trainee Appraiser

The meeting was called to order at 8:32 AM MDT by Paul J Morgan.

**INTRODUCTIONS**

Mr. Krema introduced himself to the Board.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the minutes of February 11, 2019. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

**DISCIPLINE**

Mr. Nelson presented a memorandum regarding case number REA-2019-4. After discussion, the Board gave recommendations for appropriate discipline.

## **LEGISLATIVE REPORT**

Ms. Packer gave the legislative report. She updated the Board on current legislation.

Mr. McQuade updated the Board on the Red Tape Reduction Act, and noted that the Idaho Real Estate Appraiser Board's Laws and Rules are scheduled for review this year with modifications to be presented in the 2020 Legislative Session. The Bureau will update the Board as the process progresses.

## **FINANCIAL REPORT**

Ms. Hall gave the financial report, which indicated that the Board had a cash balance of \$764,798.68 as of March 31, 2019.

## **INVESTIGATIVE REPORT**

Ms. Peel gave the investigative report, which is linked above.

## **FOR BOARD DETERMINATION**

The Board directed Bureau staff to forward case I-REA-2019-8 to the Board prosecutor. Mr. Brinton was recused.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the Bureau's recommendation and authorize closure in cases I-REA-2019-6 and I-REA-2019-15. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried. Mr. Brinton was recused.

Mr. Brinton made a motion to approve the Bureau's recommendation and authorize closure in case I-REA-2019-17. It was seconded by Mr. McClaran. Motion carried. Mr. Calhoun was recused.

## **REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION OF BOARD DECISIONS**

Mr. Crema reviewed the process for reconsideration of Board decisions and the 21-day time period in which a respondent can request reconsideration. Mr. Calhoun made a motion to authorize the Board Chair to determine whether a meeting should be convened to reconsider a decision or to let the denial stand by operation of law. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried.

## **OLD BUSINESS**

The Board reviewed the To Do List and no action was taken.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

## **APPRAISAL SUBCOMMITTEE (ASC) REVIEW**

Ms. V. Metcalf introduced herself and Ms. Brooks as policy managers for the Appraisal Subcommittee (ASC). She explained the role of the ASC and presented each Board member with the ASC's 2018 Annual Report and the May 1, 2018 Real Property Appraisal Qualification Criteria. Ms. V. Metcalf explained the current policy statements. She thanked the Board members for their willingness to serve as Board members and explained the compliance review process. She explained that a review is to ensure that a state is compliant with Title XI and meets the minimum requirements outlined in the Real Property Appraisal Qualification Criteria. Ms. V. Metcalf explained that the Bureau should receive preliminary reports for both the appraiser program and the appraisal management company (AMC) program in approximately 30 days. The Board will then have 60 days to respond. The ASC will review both the preliminary reports and the Board response(s) in order to compile and issue the final compliance review reports and program ratings.

Mr. Calhoun asked if the ASC will be creating a new policy that addresses bifurcated appraisals. Ms. V. Metcalf stated that it was a topic of discussion at the Appraisal Standards Board's (ASB) recent meeting and will also be discussed at the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials (AARO) spring conference in May.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion that the Board go into executive session under Idaho Code § 74-206(1)(d) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure under the Idaho Public Records Law. The purpose of the executive session was to consider license application materials. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Mr. Calhoun amended the motion to state that the Board go into executive session under Idaho Code § 74-108(6) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure under the Idaho Public Records Law. The purpose of the executive session was to consider licensing examination materials. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. The vote was: Mr. Morgan, aye; Mr. Calhoun, aye; Ms. McClaran, aye; and Mr. Brinton, aye. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to come out of executive session. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. The vote was: Mr. Morgan, aye; Mr. Calhoun, aye; Ms. McClaran, aye; and Mr. Brinton, aye. Motion carried.

## **JURISPRUDENCE EXAMINATION REVIEW**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to adopt the discussed changes to the jurisprudence exam. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried.

## **RATIFY APPLICATION UPDATES**

The Board reviewed application updates resulting from the Legislature's passage of the Board's proposed fee rule. Mr. Calhoun made a motion to ratify the applications. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried.

## **CORRESPONDENCE**

The Board reviewed correspondence from Ms. Janet Putnam regarding a refund request for disciplinary fines that were paid the day before her husband's death. The Board directed the Bureau to respond with its sincere condolences on the loss of her husband, but, explain that the Board does not have the authority to refund disciplinary fines.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion that the Board go into executive session under Idaho Code § 74-206(1)(d) to consider records that are exempt from disclosure under the Idaho Public Records Law. The purpose of the executive session was to consider license application materials. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. The vote was: Mr. Morgan, aye; Mr. Calhoun, aye; Ms. McClaran, aye; and Mr. Brinton, aye. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to come out of executive session. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. The vote was: Mr. Morgan, aye; Mr. Calhoun, aye; Ms. McClaran, aye; and Mr. Brinton, aye. Motion carried.

## **APPLICATIONS**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion directing Bureau staff to send a letter requesting additional information to applicant 901164084. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Mr. Calhoun amended his motion to state that the application has been tabled pending receipt of additional information. It was seconded by Mr. Briton. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to table the following pending receipt of an experience log for an additional two months, from which two new work samples will be selected for review:

901139354

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Mr. Calhoun amended his motion to state that instead of the Board selecting two work samples from the new experience log, the applicant may select and submit one best work sample from the experience log. Motion carried.

## **CE COURSES**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following courses:

APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – 2019 Annual Conference Day 1  
APPRAISAL INSTITUTE – 2019 Annual Conference Day 2  
APPRAISERS COALITION OF WASHINGTON – 2019 Spring Conference  
ASFMRA – Introduction to Cannabis Operations and Valuation  
ASFMRA – Minerals Appraisal Seminar  
ASFMRA – Practical Rural Appraisal Work Problems: Three Approaches to Value  
ASFMRA – Farmland Drainage Tile: Valuation and Usage  
ASFMRA – Practical Rural Appraisal: Work Problems Using the New Methodology  
THE COLUMBIA INSTITUTE – Desktop Appraisals: Next Generation Valuations

It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion Carried.

## **APPLICATIONS**

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following for licensure:

SIGNATURE VALUATION MANAGEMENT                      AMC-4947

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following for the CRA examination:

901147454  
901120310  
901106542  
901149970

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Mr. Calhoun amended his motion to remove 901149970 for approval for the CRA examination. It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

Mr. Calhoun made a motion to approve the following for the LRA examination:

901149970

It was seconded by Mr. Brinton. Motion carried.

**NEXT MEETING** was scheduled for June 4, 2019 at 8:30 AM MDT.

## ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Brinton made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 12:55 PM MDT. It was seconded by Ms. McClaran. Motion carried.

---

Paul J Morgan, Chair

---

H Scott Calhoun

---

Brent Lee Stanger

---

B Jane McClaran

---

Eric J Brinton

---

Kelley Packer, Bureau Chief